

Date: 04 June 2024
Our ref: 473674
Your ref: TR030008

The Planning Inspectorate
Major Applications & Plans
Temple Quay House
Temple Quay
Bristol
BS1 6PN

Imminghamget@planninginspectorate.gov.uk

BY EMAIL ONLY

Dear Inspector,

NSIP Reference Name / Code: TR030008
User Code: 20047066

Title: Natural England's comments in respect of the Immingham Green Energy Terminal Project, promoted by Associated British Ports (Deadline 4).

Examining Authority's submission deadline with a date of 04 June 2024

Natural England is a non-departmental public body. Our statutory purpose is to ensure that the natural environment is conserved, enhanced, and managed for the benefit of present and future generations, thereby contributing to sustainable development.

For any further advice on this consultation please contact the case officer Elen Squires at [REDACTED] [@naturalengland.org.uk](mailto:[REDACTED]@naturalengland.org.uk) and copy to consultations@naturalengland.org.uk.

Yours faithfully

Elen Squires
Yorkshire and Northern Lincolnshire Area Team
Natural England



Customer Services
Hornbeam House
Crewe Business Park
Electra Way
Crewe
Cheshire
CW1 6GJ

T 0300 060 3900

Natural England's Deadline 4 response.

PART I: Summary and conclusions of Natural England's advice.

PART II: Natural England's response to the Examining Authority's (ExA's) second written questions (starting on page 29)

PART III: Natural England's detailed comments on the Development Consent Order (DCO) (starting on page 30)

Summary of Natural England's advice

Natural England's advice is that, in relation to identified nature conservation issues within its remit, there is no fundamental reason of principle why the project should not be permitted. However, Natural England considers that the applicant has provided insufficient evidence and is not yet satisfied that the following issues have been resolved:

- **Internationally Designated Sites**

- In-combination assessment at appropriate assessment stage general comments (construction and operation phase) ('amber')
- Cumulative underwater noise disturbance and barrier effects to grey seal (construction and operation phase) ('amber')

Natural England has also noted a number of 'yellow' issues. We would ideally like these to be addressed, but we are satisfied that for this particular project it is unlikely to make a material difference to our advice or the outcome of the decision-making process.

- **Internationally Designated Sites**

- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Effects of dispersive (flight) and sub dispersive responses (construction phase) ('yellow')
- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Programming of works (construction phase) ('yellow')
- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation – The use of soft starts during piling (construction phase) ('yellow')
- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation – Cold weather construction restriction (construction phase) ('yellow')
- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation – The use of an Ecological Clerk of Works ('ECoW') (construction phase) ('yellow')
- Underwater noise and vibration during marine piling on qualifying species of marine mammals (construction phase) ('yellow')
- Introduction of non-native species during operation (operation phase) ('yellow')
- Air quality impacts – marine vessels – Vessel Management and Monitoring Plan (operation phase) ('yellow')
- Air quality impacts – overall comments ('yellow')
- Chapter 10 Ornithology – Assessed sensitivity of ornithology receptors ('yellow')

We welcome the further information provided by the applicant since submission of our Deadline 3 response (REP3-112) (dated 03 May 2024) and consider that the following issues have now been resolved, subject to the completion of agreed revisions to the Habitats Regulations Assessment (HRA) for internationally designated sites issues, and subject always to the appropriate requirements being adequately secured for all relevant issues:

- **Internationally Designated Sites**

- In-combination assessment at screening stage (construction and operation phase) ('green')
- Direct loss of qualifying intertidal habitat (construction phase) ('green')
- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Ambient noise levels (construction phase) ('green')
- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – The use of a 200m disturbance buffer (construction phase) ('green')

- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation – Impact of updated noise assessment on proposed mitigation (construction phase) ('green')
- Airborne noise and visual disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation – The use of GPS and markers to improve certainty about distances (construction phase) ('green')
- Air quality impacts – saltmarsh critical load (operation phase) ('green')
- Air quality impacts – marine vessels (operation phase) ('green')
- In-combination assessment – visual and noise disturbance to SPA birds (construction phase) ('green')
- Air quality – Accidental releases of ammonia ('green')

1. Part I: Summary and conclusions of Natural England's advice

- 1.1 Natural England's advice is based on information submitted by Associated British Ports (ABP) in support of its application for a Development Consent Order ('DCO) in relation to Immingham Green Energy Terminal (IGET) (*the project*).
- 1.2 Please refer to Natural England's advice provided on 23 April 2024 for our comments on the *Proposed Change Notification Report (REP2-024)*. Please note that the below advice does not relate to the *Applicant's request for comment on consultation relating to proposed Second Change Request*. Natural England will respond to the proposed changes by the close of the consultation period on 19 June 2024.
- 1.3 This letter provides an update to our Deadline 3 response (03 May 2024) (REP3-112) on key issues where Natural England's position has changed in response to additional documents submitted at Deadline 3, or where more detailed advice is being provided.
- 1.4 Please note that our Written Representations (13 March 2024) (REP1-087) and Deadline 3 response (03 May 2024) (REP3-112) should be referred to for Natural England's advice on other issues within our remit.
- 1.5 Our comments are flagged as red, amber, yellow, green or grey:
- **Red** are those where there are fundamental concerns which it may not be possible to overcome in their current form.
 - **Amber** are those where further information is required to determine the effects of the project and allow the Examining Authority to properly undertake its task and or advise that further information is required on mitigation/compensation proposals in order to provide a sufficient degree of confidence as to their efficacy.
 - **Yellow** are those where Natural England does not agree with the Applicant's position or approach. We would ideally like this to be addressed but are satisfied that for this particular project it is unlikely to make a material difference to our advice or the outcome of the decision-making process. However, we reserve the right to revise our opinion should further evidence be presented. It should be noted by interested parties that whilst these issues/comments are not raised as significant concerns in this instance, it should not be understood or inferred that Natural England would be of the same view in other cases or circumstances.
 - **Green** are those which have been successfully resolved (subject always to the appropriate requirements being adequately secured).
 - **Grey** are notes for Examiners and/or competent authority.
- 1.6 Natural England has been working with Associated British Ports (ABP) to provide advice and guidance on the IGET project since 2022 through Natural England's Discretionary Advice Service.
- 1.7 Natural England will continue discussions with ABP to seek to resolve any outstanding concerns throughout the examination. Natural England advises that the matters indicated as 'amber' will require continued consideration by the Examining Authority during the examination.
- 1.8 Natural England is now satisfied that 'green' issues are unlikely to result in adverse effects on the integrity (AEoI) of the Humber Estuary designated sites, subject always to the appropriate mitigation/compensation as outlined in the application documents being secured adequately.

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE3	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary Ramsar • Greater Wash SPA • The Wash and North Norfolk Coast SAC 	HRA screening comments – In-combination assessment at screening stage (C and O)	Natural England welcomes the provision of further clarification in the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032) regarding how the in-combination assessment at screening stage has been undertaken. Based on the information provided, Natural England concurs that the impact pathways screened out at this stage are unlikely to have a significant effect on any European site, either alone or in-combination with other plans and projects.	No further information required.	'Green'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE4	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	HRA - The potential for an AEoI due to the direct loss of qualifying intertidal habitat (C)	Natural England welcomes the updated information provided in section 4.3 of the shadow HRA (REP3-032). Based on the information provided, regarding direct loss of qualifying intertidal habitat, we consider that this matter has been addressed.	No further information required.	'Green'
NE19C	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction (C)	<u>Ambient noise levels</u> Natural England welcomes the additional information provided in the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032), and agrees that this point, in relation to additional recording of the ambient noise levels has been addressed.	No further information required.	'Green'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE19D	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction (C)	<p><u>The use of a 200m disturbance buffer</u></p> <p>Natural England notes that the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032) states that the 200m disturbance buffer will be implemented in relation to the Mean Low Water Springs contour. We advise that further information is required in the shadow HRA regarding how this addresses the previous comments. However, following discussions with the Applicant, we welcome the commitment to update the shadow HRA at Deadline 4 with further clarification, i.e. <i>“with the implementation of this mitigation, piling and other marine construction activity in the winter months will be at least 200m from intertidal habitat (and typically greater distances over most tidal phases.”</i> Therefore, the approach appears to be sufficiently precautionary.</p> <p>NE also welcomes the Applicant's commitment to update the HRA to state that <i>“The restriction distance will be controlled through a digital GPS boundary which contractors can effectively set as a spatial demarcation in which works can/cannot take place. It will then be possible to monitor compliance through reviewing the respective contractor GPS data as the works progress.”</i></p>	Updates required to HRA.	'Green'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			Therefore, based on the information provided, Natural England agrees that the proposed approach is suitable, subject to agreed updates to the shadow HRA.		
NE19E	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction (C)	<u>Effects of dispersive (flight) and sub dispersive responses</u> Natural England re-iterates that the behavioural studies cited in the ES should not be relied upon in the assessment of potential impacts on SPA birds from disturbance events. The assessment should therefore consider the sub-dispersive responses in more detail. However, we consider that the potential impacts will be adequately minimised through the provision of suitable mitigation measures.	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE20	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction – Programming of works (C)	Natural England's advice remains that it is recommended that the most disturbing marine construction works (including approach jetty) are carried out in the summer and early autumn, with works that are less disturbing to the SPA birds taking place during the coldest months (December to February inclusive). However, we consider that the potential impacts will be adequately minimised through the provision of suitable mitigation measures.	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'
NE21A	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SPA 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation	<u>Impact of updated noise assessment on proposed mitigation</u> Natural England welcomes the provision of project specific noise measurements from within the Order limits of the project in the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032). Natural England note that these updated measurements do not affect the assessment of the proposed mitigation measures. We therefore agree that this point,	No further information required.	'Green'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary Ramsar 	(C)	in relation to the need for an updated assessment in line with the updated noise measurements, has been addressed.		
NE21B	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation (C)	<u>The use of soft starts during piling</u> Natural England re-iterate that soft start piling may reduce the 'startle effect' on birds when piling starts, but it is not generally used as a mitigation measure to reduce the impacts on SPA waterbirds. We advise that there is no robust evidence to suggest that soft start piling prevents disturbance caused by the noise. Therefore, we do not consider that soft-start piling provides effective additional mitigation for disturbance to SPA birds. However, we consider that the potential impacts will be adequately minimised through the provision of suitable mitigation measures.	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE21C	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation (C)	<p><u>The use of GPS and markers to improve certainty about distances</u></p> <p>As detailed in NE19D, NE welcomes the Applicant's commitment to update the HRA to state that <i>"The restriction distance will be controlled through a digital GPS boundary which contractors can effectively set as a spatial demarcation in which works can/cannot take place. It will then be possible to monitor compliance through reviewing the respective contractor GPS data as the works progress."</i></p> <p>Therefore, based on the information provided, Natural England agrees that this issue is resolved, subject to agreed updates to the shadow HRA.</p>	Updates required to HRA.	'Green'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE21D	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation (C)	<u>Cold weather construction restriction</u> Natural England advises that the effectiveness of the cold weather construction restriction should be included in the shadow HRA Appendix E Waterbird Mitigation Effectiveness Summary. We also recommend that a more precautionary buffer distance should be used, for example 300m, during very severe weather.	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'
NE21E	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SPA 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation	<u>Cold weather construction restriction</u> Natural England notes that <i>“it is proposed that a temporary cessation of all construction activity within 200 m of Mean Low Water Springs is implemented following seven consecutive days of freezing (zero or sub-zero temperature) weather conditions.”</i> We would welcome confirmation that this would be based on records from a local weather station.	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary Ramsar 	(C)	Natural England recommends that a shorter period than 7 days of freezing conditions is used.		
NE21F	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Airborne Noise and Visual Disturbance to birds during construction – Proposed mitigation (C)	<u>The use of an Ecological Clerk of Works ('ECoW')</u> Natural England welcome the commitment in 4.10.32 of the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032) that a suitably qualified Ecological Clerk of Works (ECoW) will be present on site during the construction period to ensure that agreed mitigation measures are adhered to and therefore avoid disturbance to SPA birds. Natural England advise that this is an important aspect of the suite of mitigation measures proposed and to increase the certainty that mitigation measures will be effective. We reiterate our recommendation that further details should be provided regarding	Further information welcomed	'Yellow'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			the role of the ECoW, such as how they will monitor and implement any required measures.		
NE23	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	HRA - Underwater noise and vibration during marine piling on qualifying species of marine mammals (C)	Natural England is of the opinion that the production of an MMMP would be useful as the project includes non-standard mitigation i.e. cease piling if marine mammals are observed in the mitigation zone.	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE29	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	HRA – introduction of non-native species during operation (O)	<p>Natural England agree with the Applicant's conclusions that there will be no adverse effect on integrity from the potential introduction and spread of non-native species during operation, subject to securing and implementation of ABP's existing biosecurity management procedures (Table 32 of the shadow HRA).</p> <p>However, we would encourage that an overall biosecurity management plan including the operational facility is produced and we welcome further discussion.</p>	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'
NE32	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Air quality impacts – saltmarsh critical load (O)	Based on the information provided in the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032), Natural England agrees that the critical loads used in the assessment are considered appropriate.	No further information required.	'Green'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE33A	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Air quality impacts – marine vessels (O)	Natural England welcomes the further information provided in the Statement of Common Ground (REP3-052) and agrees that this point, in relation to the determination of 292 vessels as a maximum, has been addressed.	No further information required	'Green'
NE33B	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary SPA 	Air quality impacts – marine vessels (O)	<p>Natural England welcomes the further information provided in the Statement of Common Ground (REP3-052). We advise that it is the role of the Planning Inspectorate to determine whether the maximum number of vessel movements is adequately secured, as these values are relied upon in the HRA conclusions.</p> <p>Natural England would welcome a Vessel Management and Monitoring Plan, to ensure that vessel movements remain within the assessed limits.</p>	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary Ramsar 				
NE34	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SAC Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary Ramsar 	Air quality impacts – overall comments	<p>Natural England welcomes the commitment in the Applicant's Comments on D1 Submissions from Natural England (REP2-013), to provide the source apportionment of site and vessel emissions to Project pollutant contributions, as reported in the Environmental Statement, in a Technical Note. We will review the information when submitted.</p> <p>It is noted that the Applicant's Comments on D1 Submissions from Natural England (REP2-013) stated that text on potential emissions from flare stacks would be added to the shadow HRA at Deadline 3. Natural England notes that this information has not yet been provided, and re-highlights that whilst we note and accept the justification provided regarding flare stack modelling, this information should be incorporated into the HRA.</p>	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE36	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SAC Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary Ramsar 	HRA - In-combination assessment at appropriate assessment stage general comments (C and O)	<p>Natural England has outstanding comments on the in-combination assessment for physical loss of (or change to) habitat and cumulative underwater noise disturbance and barrier effects to grey seal (NE38).</p> <p>Natural England advises that further information should be provided in the in-combination assessment regarding physical loss of (or change to) habitat and associated species on qualifying habitats and species of the Humber Estuary SAC (Table 35), in line with agreed updates to the assessment of impacts from the project alone.</p> <p>For example, the in-combination assessment for intertidal habitat loss from IGET and IERRT relies on the justification that the losses are considered to be “<i>de minimis changes in mudflat extent.</i>” However, as detailed by Natural England in our previous responses (including REP3-112), we advise that further information, particularly regarding ecological impacts, is required to determine a conclusion of no AEol. We advise that spatial extent alone is not sufficient enough to support a conclusion of no AEol, other factors such as the ecological integrity, functioning and overall quality of the habitat that will be lost should be taken into account.</p>	Further information required to determine requirement for further mitigation.	‘Amber’

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			<p>As previously highlighted in RR-019, the intertidal mudflats and sandflats features has a restore objective for the 'extent and distribution of habitat' attribute, therefore this feature is not currently achieving its conservation objectives. We advise that the appropriate assessment should provide clear reasoning why a combined reduction of this habitat can be considered ecologically inconsequential.</p> <p>Therefore, Natural England advises that the in-combination assessment should be updated in line with this advice, to determine whether a conclusion of no AEol can be reached for the relevant projects in-combination.</p>		

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE38	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	HRA – Cumulative underwater noise disturbance and barrier effects to grey seal (C and O)	<p>At this stage, Natural England's position broadly remains as set out in NE38 of our Relevant Representations (RR-019). Natural England welcomes the updates made to the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032), including the separation of injury and disturbance impacts to grey seals.</p> <p>However, the in-combination assessment still lacks detail and relies on mitigation which is aimed at reducing injury not barrier effects/disturbance. The in-combination assessment (Table 35 and Table 37 of the shadow HRA) has only considered the impacts of the IGET project with each of the other projects separately. We maintain that more detail should be provided on the nature of the combined effects for <u>all</u> the projects together. The Applicant should examine the associated timings of the piling campaigns, of all the relevant projects together, to check whether any are scheduled to occur simultaneously in a month/year and assess what the combined effects will be. When considering barrier effects/disturbance from all the projects together, we advise that the Applicant provide sufficient evidence to support their claim that impacts will be short-term and temporary.</p>	Further information required.	'Amber'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			Please refer to NE36 of our Relevant Representation (RR-019) for further advice on the in-combination assessment.		
NE39	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	HRA – In-combination assessment – Visual and noise disturbance to SPA birds (c)	Natural England agrees with the conclusions of the in-combination assessment for visual and noise disturbance to SPA birds, subject to agreed updates to the shadow HRA regarding mitigation for the project alone (as detailed above).	No further information required.	'Green'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE42	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary Ramsar Humber Estuary SPA 	Chapter 10 Ornithology – Assessed sensitivity of ornithology receptors	<p>Natural England note that whilst turnstone have a low sensitivity to disturbance, there is a threshold after which they will not be able to tolerate any increased disturbance, even of a type to which they appear to be habituated, and it is not possible to accurately determine this threshold in advance of works.</p> <p>However, we consider that the potential impacts will be adequately minimised through the provision of suitable mitigation measures. We refer to NE21F for further advice regarding the Ecological Clerk of Works (ECoW).</p>	Further information welcomed.	'Yellow'
NE43	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Humber Estuary SPA Humber Estuary Ramsar 	South Humber Gateway Mitigation Strategy	<p>Natural England reiterates that the development falls within the South Humber Gateway Mitigation Zone. Policy 9 of the North East Lincolnshire Local Plan states <i>“Development proposals on greenfield land within the Mitigation Zone will be required to make contributions towards the provision and management of the mitigation sites identified on the Policies Map.”</i></p> <p>Whilst we acknowledge that 1.4.40 of the HRA describes the limited habitat suitability of the West Site area for SPA birds and refers to wintering bird survey results that recorded no SPA birds within this area, Natural England considers that the South Humber Gateway Mitigation Strategy is intended to apply to all relevant</p>		'Grey'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			<p>developments within this zone to address the adverse impacts of development at a strategic level, irrespective of whether the individual development site is determined to be functionally linked land in further bird surveys. Therefore, the requirement to contribute to the scheme should be determined by the relevant authority.</p>		
NE49	Protected Species	Protected species - General	<p>Natural England has adopted <u>standing advice</u> for protected species, which includes guidance on survey and mitigation measures. Natural England is not providing bespoke advice on the protected species information provided in the ES for this project. A separate protected species licence from Natural England or Defra may be required. Applicants should refer to the guidance at <u>Wildlife licences: when you need to apply</u> to check to see if a mitigation licence is required. Applicants can also make use of Natural England's charged service <u>Pre Submission Screening Service</u> for a review of a draft wildlife licence application. Natural England can then review a full draft licence application to issue a Letter of No Impediment (LONI) which explains that based on the information reviewed to date, that it sees no impediment to a licence being granted in the future should the DCO be issued. See Advice Note Eleven, Annex C – Natural England and the Planning</p>	Requirement for mitigation not assessed by Natural England.	'Grey'

Table 1: Natural England’s detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			Inspectorate National Infrastructure Planning for details of the LONI process.		
NE51	Biodiversity Net Gain (BNG)	Biodiversity Net Gain (BNG) - no BNG provision (c)	<p>The Environment Act 2021 includes NSIPs in the requirement for BNG. The biodiversity gain objective for NSIPs is defined as at least a 10% increase in the pre-development biodiversity value of the on-site habitat.</p> <p>It’s the intention that BNG should apply to all terrestrial NSIPs accepted for examination from November 2025. This includes the intertidal zone but excludes the subtidal zone.</p> <p>Although BNG is not yet a mandatory requirement for NSIPs, we strongly recommend that net gain provision is secured through this development. This will reflect the important role NSIPs must play in delivering the government’s environmental targets.</p> <p>Early engagement with Natural England on BNG proposals will help maximise outcomes and reduce risks.</p>		‘Grey’

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			<p>The biodiversity baseline should include all land contained within the site's red line boundary and proposals can be iteratively refined over time and throughout detailed design.</p> <p>We encourage developers to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • develop their BNG proposals in adherence with well-established BNG principles. To encourage best practice, we can also direct developers to the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ BS 8683:2021 Process for designing and implementing Biodiversity Net Gain ○ CIEEM/IEMA/CIRIA good practice principles (2016) and guidance (2019). • We recommend that developers use the latest version of the Defra biodiversity metric to calculate BNG (currently version 4.0) and adhere to the rules and principles set out within the metric guidance. <p>Biodiversity gains should be secured for a minimum of 30 years and be subject to adaptive management and monitoring. BNG</p>		

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
			plans should be secured by a suitably worded requirement in the DCO.		
NE53	Ancient woodland		Natural England has adopted <u>standing advice</u> for ancient woodland, which should be referred to. Natural England is not providing bespoke advice on the ancient woodland information provided in the ES for this project.	Requirement for mitigation not assessed by Natural England.	'Grey'

Table 1: Natural England's detailed advice					
NE key issue ref	Topic	Issue summary (C) – construction phase (O) – operational phase	Natural England commentary and advice on the further information required to enable assessment	Natural England comment on the mechanism for securing mitigation/ compensation measures in the DCO/ deemed marine licence	Risk (RAG)
NE54	International designated sites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humber Estuary SAC • Humber Estuary SPA • Humber Estuary Ramsar 	HRA – air quality – accidental releases of ammonia	Natural England welcomes the additional information provided in the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032), and agrees that this point, in relation to the assessment of accidental releases of ammonia, has been addressed.	No further information required.	'Green'

1. PART II: Natural England’s response to the Examining Authority’s (ExA’s) second written questions with a deadline of 04 June 2024

Table 2: Natural England’s response to Examiner’s initial questions			
ExA question ref	Question addressed to	Question	Answer
HRA 2.5	Natural England	<p>Clarification of in-combination concerns</p> <p>The Applicant updated the screening Tables in the sHRA at DL1 [REP1-012] providing additional text in the ‘justification’ column to consider in-combination effects. NE’s response at DL3 [REP3-112, issue NE3] requests further clarification and preference for a separate column to address these effects. The ExA acknowledges that the Applicant’s approach is high level and does not distinguish between small effects and no pathway for effect, lacking detailed justification for why in-combination effects are considered negligible. Despite this methodological deficiency, NE is requested to highlight any specific impact pathways where it is concerned that the absence of this information is likely to make a material difference in the screening conclusion.</p>	<p>Natural England welcomes the provision of further clarification in the updated shadow HRA (REP3-032) regarding how the in-combination assessment at screening stage has been undertaken. Based on the information provided, Natural England concurs that the impact pathways screened out at this stage are unlikely to have a significant effect on any European site, either alone or in-combination with other plans and projects.</p>

1. PART III: Natural England’s detailed comments on the Development Consent Order (DCO), Deemed Marine Licence (DML) and associated documents

1.1 Part III of these Representations provides Natural England’s detailed comments on the draft DCO Order and draft DMO.

1.2 Natural England’s comments on the updated draft DCO and DML (REP3-004) (May 2024) have not changed since our comments provided at Deadline 1 (REP1-087). We have included our detailed advice on these below with updated page numbers.

Natural England’s Deadline 4 response, Part III, Table 3

Page	DCO/DML or Omission ref	Natural England’s comments
17	Article 18 Discharge of water	Natural England supports the advice provided by the Environment Agency in their Relevant Representations (RR-010) dated 01 December 2023.
18	Article 19 Authority to survey and investigate the land	Natural England highlights that any operations outside of red line boundary (order limits) should require appropriate permissions, including consent/assent from Natural England for any planned activity that’s likely to damage the Humber Estuary SSSI or land near the site’s boundary - i.e. survey work, intrusive site investigations (boreholes etc).
56	Article 6 Construction Environmental Management Plan	Natural England welcomes the commitment to secure the Construction Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) (REP3-026) and highlight that this should be updated in line with the mitigation measures included in the shadow HRA.
36	Article 45 Powers to dredge	This Article appears to contradict the DML Article 4(3) that <i>‘It is acknowledged that pursuant to section 75 of the 2009 Act the undertaker does not need a marine licence to carry out maintenance dredging within the statutory harbour authority area of the Port of Immingham and that the disposal of dredged arisings for such maintenance dredging is permitted in accordance with the existing marine licence.’</i> Please clarify.
N/A	N/A	Natural England advises that, in addition to construction mitigation measures secured in the CEMP, any operational mitigation measures should be appropriately secured in the DCO.

Page	DCO/DML or Omission ref	Natural England's comments
N/A	N/A	As detailed above (NE33b), Natural England considers that it should be determined whether there is a requirement to secure the maximum number of vessel movements in the DCO, as these values are relied upon in the HRA conclusions. Natural England would welcome a Vessel Management and Monitoring Plan, to ensure that vessel movements remain within the assessed limits.

Table 3: Natural England's comments on the Deemed Marine Licence.

Page	DCO/DML or Omission ref	Natural England's comments
67 and 69	Articles 8 and 15 Construction Environmental Management Plan	Natural England welcomes the commitment to secure the Construction Environmental Management Plan (REP3-026), and highlight that this should be updated in line with the mitigation measures included in the shadow HRA.
69	Article 16 Piling and marine construction works	Natural England welcomes the commitment to secure the marine piling mitigation measures as outlined in the shadow Habitats Regulations Assessment (REP3-032). We advise, however, that the condition should be amended to include the maximum hammer energy that will be used to pile. This is a key impact parameter and should be restricted to the maximum scope assessed in the Environmental Statement to ensure the impacts remain within those assessed and approved through consent.